

## H-Net: Humanities and Social Sciences Online

**From:** H-HOAC-ED-JEH <haynes@MAIL.H-NET.MSU.EDU>  
**List Editor:** H-HOAC-ED-JEH <haynes@MAIL.H-NET.MSU.EDU>  
**Editor's Subject:** Gorsky Nemo Symposium: Translation of Notes on Gorsky Memo  
**Author's Subject:** Gorsky Nemo Symposium: Translation of Notes on Gorsky Memo  
**Date Written:** Mon, 14 Mar 2005 12:38:34 -0500  
**Date Posted:** Mon, 14 Mar 2005 12:38:34 -0500

Alexander Vassiliev's Notes on Anatoly Gorsky's December 1948 Memo on Compromised American Sources and Networks

Translated by Ronald Bachman and Harold Leich, assisted by John Earl Haynes

Alexander Vassiliev, a former KGB officer, coauthored *The Haunted Wood: Soviet Espionage in America -- The Stalin Era* with Allen Weinstein. Under

an agreement with the SVR (successor to the KGB), Vassiliev has access to a segment of KGB records dealing with Soviet espionage in the United States. While he could not remove copies from the archive, he could make notes. Below is a translation of Vassiliev's handwritten notes on a December 1948 memo written by Anatoly Gorsky, former chief of the KGB station in Washington

The complete notes were made public as a part of *Vassiliev v Frank Cass & Co Ltd.*, a 2003 libel case in the United Kingdom. David Lowenthal obtained a copy and provided it to Eduard Mark who provided a copy to John Earl Haynes in January 2005. David Lowenthal cites the document as: transcript of KGB file 43173 vol.2 (v) pp. 49-55, attached to Alexander Vassiliev to Hartwig, 1 February 2002, in *Alexander Vassiliev and Frank Cass & Co Ltd*, High Court of Justice Queen's Bench Division Claim No. HQ1X03222, Amended Particulars of Claim.

Russian linguists Harold Leich and Ronald Bachman prepared both a transcription of Vassiliev's handwritten notes in Russian (Vassiliev's handwriting is not always clear) to typed Cyrillic Russian and a translation to Latin alphabet English. John Earl Haynes assisted in providing conventional English spellings for names phonetically translated from the Russian. David Lowenthal also reviewed the translations and made suggestions on items.

Below is the English language translation. Materials in brackets are interpolations. Page numbers given in the text are Vassiliev's notes of the page of the archival file from which his note was extracted.

\*\*\*\*\*

[Vassiliev's Notes begins in middle of a sentence]

[illegible] middle of 1949 essentially terminated all efforts to seek out recruiters and new agents

[illegible] refrained from reestablishing links with failed agents.

p. 47.

"In its practical operations, the rezidentura has proceeded along the path of least resistance, either recruiting persons widely known for their links to the Communist Party of the U.S.A. ("Jack," "Guide," "Lana," "Rur," "Kan [Kahn]," et al.) or trying to employ as agents persons from the people's democracies who are sympathetic to us but do not have access to information of interest."

The responsibility rests on the deputy rezident "Fyodor." Because of his preoccupation with fundamental work, "Vladimir" cannot be involved in all [aspects ?] of operational activities.

p. 48.

It is essential to complement your [illegible] rezidentura with the best cadres of KI workers.

\_Collapses in the U.S.A. (1938-48)\_

p. 49.

"Karl's" Group

1. Karl - Whittaker Chambers, former chief [or senior] editor of the magazine "Time." Traitor.
2. Jerome - Barna Bukov (Altman), our former cadre colleague. Now in the USSR.
3. Leonard - Alger Hiss, former employee of the State Department.
4. Junior - Donald Hiss, former employee of the Ministry of Internal Affairs.
5. 104th - Henry A. Wadleigh, former employee of the State Department.
6. 118th - F. V. Reno, former employee of Aberdeen proving ground.
7. 105th - Henry Collins, former employee of the Department of Agriculture, presently the director of the American-Russian Institute in New York.
8. 114th - William W. Pigman, former employee of the Bureau of Standards.
9. "Storm" - Joseph Peters (aka Isidore Burstein), former member of the Central Committee of the CPUSA.
10. "Wig" - Lee Pressman, former [illegible ? consul ? legal counsel?] of the Congress of Industrial Organizations.
11. 116th - Harry Azizov, former employee of a steel-smelting company in Chicago.
12. 101st - Peter MacLean, reporter and photojournalist, not used since '37.

p. 50

13. 103rd - David Carpenter, newspaper employee.
14. 107th - Felix Inslerman, place of employment unknown.
15. 113th - Harry Rosenthal, employee of an insurance company in Philadelphia.
16. 115th - Lester Hubsch [Hubel ? Hutsch ? Hume? ], former employee of the Frankford Arsenal.
17. "Ernst" - Noel Field, former employee of the State Department.
18. "Rupert" - V.V. Sveshnikov [Sveshchnikov ?], former employee of the War Department.
19. "Richard" - Harry White, former assistant of Treasury Secretary Morgenthau, died in '48.
20. "Aileron" - D. Silverman, former chief of planning, statistics department of the AAF [literal translation: "VVS" for Military Air Force?]
21. "Ruble" - Harold Glasser, former chief of the Monetary section of the Treasury Department.

"Redhead's Group"

1. "Redhead" - Hedwiga Gompertz , Wacek's wife, sent to the U.S. in '38 to carry out fieldwork assignments, traitor since '48.
2. "Wacek" [or Vacek] - Paul Massing, scientist at Columbia University's Institute of Social Research. Traitor.
3. "Oscar" - Oscar Bernstein, lawyer, used for organizing covers for our workers in the U.S.
4. "Prince" ["Kniaz'"] - Laurence Duggan (aka 19th), former employee of the State Department. Suicide.
5. "Ruff" ["Ersh"] - Franz Neumann, former consultant in the Department of Research and Analysis of the OSS.
6. "Vardo" - E. Y. Zarubina, our former cadre colleague. [Residing] in the USSR.

p. 51

"Buben's Group"

1. "Buben" - Louis Budenz, former member of the Central Committee of the CPUSA, former editor of the newspaper Daily Worker, presently a professor at Fordham Catholic University.
2. "Bob" - Robert Menaker, commercial traveler [traveling salesman] to a variety of trade firms.
3. "Liberal" - Frank Palmer [?]. Place of employment unknown. Former member of the CPUSA, broke with the Communist Party in '37. "Buben" was recruited with his assistance.

4. "Chap" ["Chen"?] - Franklin Salmond, without specific assignments, husband of "Rita." Used as a "signaller" [Russian: sviazist = communications man, telephone/telegraph worker].

5. "Rita" - (aka "Satyr"). Sylvia Caldwell, technical secretary for a Trotskyite group in New York.

6. "Harry" - Rabinovich, our former cadre colleague, [resides] in the USSR.

"Sound" and "Myrna" Groups

1. "Sound" - Jacob Golos (Raisin), our former illegal colleague in the U.S. Died in '43.

2. "Myrna" - Elizabeth Bentley, former vice-president of the company United States Service and Shipping Corporation. Traitor since '45.

3. "Tan" - Harry Magdoff, former employee of the Commerce Department.

4. "Ted" - Edward Fitzgerald, former employee of the Commerce Department.

5. "Mole" - Charles Kramer, former adviser to Senator Pepper.

6. "Izra" - Donald Wheeler, former OSS employee.

7. "Sid" - Allan Rosenberg, former employee of the Foreign Economic Administration [Literal translation: International Economics Administration].

8. "Dan" - Stanley Graze, State Department intelligence employee.

9. "Arena" - Gerald Graze, Dan's brother, former Department of Defense employee.

10. "Battle" [Boi] - Charles Flato, former employee of the Foreign Economic Administration.

11. "Raid" - Victor Perlo, former employee of the War Production Board.

12. "Robert" - Gregory Silvermaster (also Pal), former employee of the Reconstruction Financial Corporation in the Department of Commerce.

13. "Vim" [?] - (aka Page), Lauchlin Currie, former aide to President Roosevelt.

14. "Peak" - Frank Coe, former chief of the monetary section of the Treasury Department.

15. "Acorn" - Bela Gold, former employee of the Commerce Department.

16. "Zhenya" [Genya, Jenya] - Sonia Gold, former secretary to the chief of the Monetary Research Administration of the Treasury Department.

17. "Tino" - Irving Kaplan, former employee of the Foreign Economic Administration.

18. "Sax" ["Sachs"] - Solomon Adler, former employee of the U.S. Treasury Department.

19. "Pilot" - Ludwig Ullmann, former employee of the U.S. Department of War.
  20. "Buck" ["Bak"] - David Weintraub, former employee of the UNRRA [United Nations Relief and Rehabilitation Administration].
  21. "X" ["Iks"] - (aka Informer). Joseph Katz, our old agent/group leader [gruppovik] co-owner of a glove factory, a front that we set up, is currently forming a company in Italy to cover our illegal courier line between Europe and U.S.
  22. "Adam" - Eva Getzov [Getsov, Getzoff], employee, Jewish Welfare Board.
  23. "Hare" - Maurice Halperin, former employee. OSS.
  24. "Koch" - Duncan Lee, former employee. OSS.
  25. "Muse" - Helen Tenney, former employee. OSS.
  26. "Flora" - Ruth Rivkin, former employee, UNRRA.
  28. [27.] "Mon" - Bernard Redmont, former employee of the Rockefeller Commission [Office of the Co-ordinator of Inter-American Affairs headed by Nelson Rockefeller].
  28. "Mirage" - Robert Miller, former employee of the State Department.
  - [29. missing number] "Gift" ["Dar"or possibly Dir for "Dear"] - Mary Price, former secretary of American journalist Lippmann.
  30. "Gor" ["Hor"?] - Joseph Gregg, former employee of the Rockefeller Commission.
  31. "Teddy" - William Remington, former employee of the War Production Board.
  32. "Cautious" [Watchful, Careful] - Julius Joseph, former OSS employee.
  33. "Echo" - S. Schuster, staff member of the Central Committee of the CPUSA.
  34. "Irma" - Ray Elson, former vice-president of "United States Service and Shipping Corporation."
- p. 54
35. "Green" - John Spivak, journalist, before '41 with the Trotskyites.
  35. [repeated number] "Vadim" - A. V. Gorsky, former resident of the MGB USSR in Washington, [resides] in the USSR.
  36. "Louise" [unclear, Lucy ? Lucie ?] - Pravdina, former employee of the Ministry of Trade, wife of "Sergei," the resident in New York, [resides] in the USSR.
  37. "Sergei" - V. Pravdin, former resident of the MGB USSR in New York, [resides] in the USSR.
  38. "Stock" ["Shtok"] - our cadre colleague M. Shaliapin [Shalyapin], [resides] in the USSR.
  39. "Gennady" - G. B. Ovakimian, former resident of the MGB USSR in New York, [resides] in the USSR.

40. "Albert" - A. I. Akhmerov, former illegal resident of the MGB USSR in New York, [resides] in the USSR.

41. "Elza" - Akhmerova, Albert's wife, American, Soviet citizen, [resides] in the USSR.

42. "Mushroom" ["Gruzd," a type of mushroom] - Willard Park, employee of the Rockefeller Commission.

43. "Charlie" - Cedric Belfrage, former employee of the English intelligence rezidentura in New York. Presently a journalist.

The "Berg" - "Art" Group

1. "Berg" - Alexander Koral, former engineer of the municipality of New York.

2. "Art" - Helen Koral, Berg's wife, housewife.

3. "Son" ["San"] - Richard Koral, son, student.

4. "Long" - Norman Hite [Haight?], engineer for the firm "Sperry Gyroscope Company" in New Jersey.

5. "Smart" - Elliot Goldberg, engineer for an oil equipment company in New York.

6. "Huron" ["Guron"] - Byron T. Darling, engineer for the Rubber Company.

7. "Teacher" ["Uchitel'nitsa," female ending] - Melamed, teacher in a music school in New York.

8. "Cora" ["Kora"] - Emma Phillips, housewife.

9. "Lois" [Lok] - Sylvia Koral, former secretary of the code section, Office of War Information.

10. "Siskin" ["Chizh," a type of bird] - Eduardo Pekino [Pequeño?], businessman in Caracas, Venezuela.

11. "Express Messenger" ["Gonets"] - Richard Setaro, journalist/writer, former employee of the Columbia Broadcasting System, presently in Buenos Aires.

12. "Artem" - A. Slavianin, our cadre colleague, [resides] in the USSR.

13. "Twain" ["Tven"] - S. M. Semenov [Semyonov], resident, technical intelligence for the KI in Paris, presently on leave in Moscow.

14. "Aleksey" [Alexey] - A. A. Yatskov, our cadre colleague, [resides] in the USSR.

15. "Julia" - O. V. Shimmel, our cadre colleague, [resides] in the USSR.

16. "Shah" - K. A. Chugunov, our cadre colleague, [resides] in the USSR.

-- A. Gorsky (December '48)

[End of Gorsky Memo]



Copyright © 1995-2005 - [Contact Us](#)  
[RSS](#) | [Validate: XHTML](#) | [CSS](#)

**H-Net: Humanities and Social Sciences Online**

**From:** johnearlhaynes@comcast.net  
**List Editor:** H-HOAC-ED-JEH <haynes@MAIL.H-NET.MSU.EDU>  
**Editor's Subject:** John Lowenthal & the Haunted Wood (Haynes)  
**Author's Subject:** John Lowenthal & the Haunted Wood (Haynes)  
**Date Written:** Mon, 3 Jan 2005 17:21:51 -0500  
**Date Posted:** Mon, 3 Jan 2005 17:21:51 -0500

Subj: John Lowenthal & the Haunted Wood

Re: Mr. David Lowenthal's <Contrary to Haynes, Field's 1957 letter is NOT quoted in the first (1978) edition of Perjury.>

The statement above is mistaken and it is difficult to understand how it could be made.

In a post of 27 December I noted that John Lowenthal had written that the historian Allen Weinstein "omit[ed] any reference" to Noel Field's 1957 denial of Hede Massing's testimony.

I noted that Weinstein had written:

"When Noel Field wrote to Hiss in 1957, after his release from a Hungarian prison, he commented on Hede Massing's story: 'Speaking of perjury, it was, of course, not until I came out of jail that I learned of the part played in your second trial by false testimony of a perjured witness with regard to a purported meeting and a conversation, neither of which ever took place, either within or without the confines of our Washington apartment.' He called Mrs. Massing's account of meeting Hiss at the Field residence an 'outrageous lie' and a 'complete untruth.'" [Weinstein, Perjury, 1997 ed. p. 178]"

I noted that the passage was also in the original 1978 edition of Perjury: The Hiss-Chambers Case.

Mr. David Lowenthal says that the passage is not in the 1978 edition.

I have, as I type these words, the original 1978 edition of Perjury, published by Alfred A. Knopf of New York open before me. I find the following passage:

"When Noel Field wrote to Hiss in 1957, after his release from a Hungarian prison, he commented on Hede Massing's story: 'Speaking of perjury, it was, of course, not until I came out of jail that I learned of the part played in your second trial by false testimony of a perjured witness with regard to a purported meeting and a conversation, neither of which ever took place, either within or



without the confines of our Washington apartment.' He called Mrs. Massing's account of meeting Hiss at the Field residence an 'outrageous lie' and a 'complete untruth.'" [Weinstein, \_Perjury\_, 1978 ed. p. 204]

The only difference between the two is that the fonts are different between the two books and, thus, the pagination.

The statement <Contrary to Haynes, Field's 1957 letter is NOT quoted in the first (1978) edition of \_Perjury\_.> is mistaken, at least in my universe.

Also mistaken is the remainder of the Mr. David Lowenthal's post where it is argued that it was appropriate for John Lowenthal to cite Weinstein and Vassiliev \_The Haunted Wood\_ rather than \_Perjury\_ regarding Allen Weinstein's account of the Hiss case. We learn that Hiss is mentioned on 28 pages of \_The Haunted Wood\_. Out of 344 pages of text, that is not that much. Elizabeth Bentley is mentioned on 69 pages, Harry Gold gets 38, even Boris Morros gets 31, and there are others who get more mentions than Hiss. Hiss is simply one of many stories, and far from the major or central one, in \_The Haunted Wood\_. On the other hand, while I have not counted them individually, Alger Hiss is mentioned on at least 300 pages of \_Perjury\_, probably many more and the Hiss-Chambers case is the central focus of the book. It is indefensible to cite \_The Haunted Wood\_ but not \_Perjury\_ when discussing Weinstein's handling of Noel Field.

Nor is this the only instance of John Lowenthal playing games with citations in order to mislead readers. He condemns: "books that present the reader with 'quoted' versions of the Soviet cablegram but with Ales's name deleted and replaced with Hiss's. Those versions do not show the Venona document's footnote marks or the footnote themselves, or even alert the reader to their existence...." [Lowenthal, "Venona and Alger Hiss," pp. 113-14]

On first reading I agreed with the point he was making. When quoting a documents such as the deciphered Venona cables it is preferable to keep the Soviet cover name and at most only accompany it with the real name in brackets so that a reader can keep straight who is who when reading a text with unfamiliar cover names. And certainly a responsible historian should note that the NSA/FBI footnote for Ales was qualified and stated that it was "probably" Alger Hiss.

However, John Lowenthal's comment was the setup for another manipulations of citations. [This is tedious to explain, so patience is needed to get to the end.]

Harvey Klehr and I in our \_Venona: Decoding Soviet Espionage in America\_ devote seven pages to discussing Alger Hiss. Two of those pages are devoted to the Ales message. On page 171 we wrote:

"The NSA/FBI footnote identifies Ales as 'probably Alger Hiss' It was not a difficult identification to make. The description of Ales in the KGB message fits Hiss and it is difficult to imagine it fitting anyone but Hiss."

We then quoted the entire message and commented on its parts:

"'As a result of A.'s chat with Ales the following has been ascertained: 1. Ales has been working with the Neighbors continuously since 1935.' The Neighbors was

KGB jargon for the GRU. Chambers had Hiss entering the CPUSA underground in 1934 and beginning to steal documents in 1935, and contended that Hiss was part of a group that came under GRU supervision. A. is unidentified but the context of other KGB Venona messages suggests this was the initial of Albert, the cover name of the illegal officer Iskhak Akhmerov. (The defector Gordievsky had linked Akhmerov to Hiss.)"

"'2. For some years past he has been the leader of a small group of the Neighbors' probationers, for the most part consisting of his relations.' 'Probationers' was standard KGB jargon for agents. Hiss's closest associates in his espionage work were his wife, Priscilla, who typed many of the documents he stole from the State Department, and his brother Donald, who also worked for the State Department for a time."

"'3. The group and Ales himself work on obtaining military information only. Materials on the Bank allegedly interest the Neighbors very little and he does not produce them regularly. 4. All the last few years Ales has been working with Pol [unidentified] who also meets other members of the group occasionally. 5. Recently Ales and his whole group were awarded Soviet decorations.' This passage indicates that Ales worked for the State Department (Bank), as Hiss did. It also says that the Neighbors/GRU were pressing Ales to produce military rather than the diplomatic information more readily available to him. In the 1920s and early 1930s when the GRU dominated Soviet foreign intelligence operations, its networks sought political and strategic information as well as more narrowly defined military intelligence. But as the KGB established its supremacy in foreign intelligence, the GRU's jurisdiction was steadily narrowed. It had to get its agents to produce more strictly military information or risk losing them to the KGB. GRU stress on military intelligence may explain the extraordinary proposal Hiss made in September 1945, that the State Department create a new post, that of 'special assistant for military affairs' linked to his Office of Special Political Affairs. The GRU's need for military intelligence also explains why when security officers belatedly began to look closely at Hiss in 1946 they discovered that he had obtained top secret reports 'on atomic energy ... and other matters relating to military intelligence' that were outside the scope of his Office of Special Political Affairs, which dealt largely with United Nations diplomacy."

"'6. After the Yalta Conference, when he had gone on to Moscow, a Soviet personage in a very responsible position (Ales gave to understand that it was Comrade Vishinski [Deputy Soviet Foreign Minister]) allegedly got in touch with Ales and at the behest of the Military Neighbors passed on to him their gratitude and so on.' This passage indicates that Ales had been at the Yalta conference and had returned to the United States through Moscow. After the Yalta conference, most of the American delegation returned directly to the United States via Iran. Those Americans attending from the U.S. embassy in Moscow returned to Moscow but did not, as Ales did, then proceed quickly to the United States. (This message came only a month after the Yalta conference ended.) There was, however, a small party of four State Department officials who flew to Moscow to finish some details with the Soviets and then proceeded after a brief layover to Washington. There has never been any allegation or evidence that three of them -- Secretary of State Edward Stettinius, Director of the Office

of

European Affairs H. Freeman Matthews, and Wilder Foote, Stettinius's press aide -- were Soviet agents. The fourth official was Alger Hiss."

In our quotation of the message Ales is quoted as Ales and in not a single instance is Hiss substituted for Ales. And, as seen above, that the NSA/FBI footnote identification of Ales as Hiss was qualified as "probably" was directly quoted in the text.

It was then with surprise and outrage that I then checked John Lowenthal's footnote as to those writers who had substituted Hiss for the cover name Ales and failed to note the footnote "probably" qualification. The very first book Lowenthal cited as guilty of these crimes was Klehr and my Venona.

But how could that be? As anyone can see from the quotation above Klehr and I in our discussion of the Ales message quoted the entire message with Ales as Ales and with no substitution of Hiss for Ales and we directly referred to and quoted the NSA/FBI footnote's "probably" qualification of its identification the text.

Once more John Lowenthal engaged in manipulation of citations. In his footnote accusing us of failing to note the "probably" qualification and substituted Hiss for the cover name Ales he cited page 352 of our book. But how can he do that when our discussion of the Ales message was on pages 171 and 172?

Going back to John Lowenthal's text one discovers a later second sentence where John Lowenthal artfully narrows his complaint: "In their GLOSSARIES, the books list Hiss as Ales and Ales as Hiss, as unqualified facts, citing Venona No. 1822 as the source but without mentioning its qualifying word 'Probably'...." [emphasis added].

Page 352 that John Lowenthal cited to criticize our book is an alphabetical appendix that lists cover names and real names. There on page 352 is a single sentence entry on Hiss and Ales. Thus by manipulating his citation, John Lowenthal was able to make our seven page discussion of Hiss in the text along with our two page discussion of the Ales message disappear and he pretended that a single sentence in an appendix was proof of scholarly failings. This is no different from his citing The Haunted Wood to accuse Weinstein of not dealing with Field's denial and making Weinstein's discussion of Field's denial in Perjury disappear.

John Lowenthal's misleading of readers on this point is also not limited to Klehr and my Venona. The British historian Nigel West in his Venona: the Greatest Secret of the Cold War, also quotes the entire Ales message with Ales as Ales and no substitution of Hiss for Ales on pages 234 and 235 of his text. (West does not mention the NSA/FBI identification at all, neither citing it as an authority for the identification or noting its "probably" qualification. One could fault this but that is only part of John Lowenthal's charge.) West's Venona is the second book John Lowenthal condemns, and again his condemnation is cited not to West's discussion of the Ales message on pages 234-235 but to a back-of-the-book alphabetical glossary listing cover names and real names on page 353. On that page West's discussion of Hiss consists of a table entry with three words: "Ales Alger Hiss"

Another book John Lowenthal condemns for substituting Hiss for Ales and for not including the NSA/FBI footnote is Daniel Patrick Moynihan's Secrecy: The American Experience. John Lowenthal's cited pages 146 & 147 of Secrecy

to document his change. Again, this is a deception. On page 148 Moynihan reproduces the entire Ales message text, with Ales as Ales and no substitution of Hiss for Ales and includes the NSA-FBI footnote with its "probably" qualification of the identification of Ales and Hiss. Indeed, Moynihan highlights the "probably" in a caption for the reproduced message. Moynihan was entirely innocent of the sin charged by John Lowenthal.

This game playing with citations and page numbers is not acceptable in a scholarly work.

John Earl Haynes



Copyright © 1995-2005 - Contact Us  
RSS | Validate: XHTML | CSS

## H-Net: Humanities and Social Sciences Online

**From:** David Lowenthal, University College London <D.Lowenthal@ucl.ac.uk>  
**List Editor:** "H-DIPLO [Fujii]" <h-d1plo@SOCRATES.BERKELEY.EDU>  
**Editor's Subject:** KGB sources and the Hiss/'Ales' dispute [Lowenthal]  
**Author's Subject:** KGB sources and the Hiss/'Ales' dispute [Lowenthal]  
**Date Written:** Tue, 4 Jan 2005 21:02:07 -0800  
**Date Posted:** Tue, 4 Jan 2005 21:02:07 -0800

Apologies for the truncated prose that led John Earl Haynes to think it was Andrew Monson who wrote the sentence about the absence of Alger Hiss as "Leonard" in any GRU files; it was not Monson but I. What I should have written was that no one has found ANY use of that cryptonym for Hiss anywhere else at all. Alexander Vassiliev himself said that he "never saw the code-name 'Leonard' in any other document" (18 June 2000).

On the subject of Judge David Eady's disallowance of Anatoly Gorsky's memo, Eady did not do so because it was "hearsay evidence," but because it had surfaced after John Lowenthal submitted his essay; and therefore since it was unavailable to Lowenthal at the time of writing it could not form part of Vassiliev's bill of complaints against him. But the judge allowed the significance of the Gorsky memo in other respects; hence the defense was able to deploy it in the ways I reported.

As to hearsay evidence, I entirely agree with Dr. Haynes that its use is essential. Indeed, there is very little history that does not rely on hearsay evidence, or, as he and Harvey Klehr admirably point out in In Denial (pp. 163-64), on archives with only partial and limited access (true of most archives). But where data is nothing but or little more than hearsay, and where its context may be dubious, its veracity, consistency, and authenticity require rigorous skeptical scrutiny. This, as John Lowenthal demonstrated in "Venona and Alger Hiss" (Intelligence and National Security 15:3 (2000)), was too often lacking in The Haunted Wood.

Dr. Haynes asks why dwell on a "minor civil court proceeding" instead of the federal criminal trials that convicted Hiss. The reasons are that the earlier trials and their verdicts were deeply flawed, as John Lowenthal spent half a lifetime demonstrating, by the F.B.I.'s concealment of potentially exculpatory evidence; that the British libel trial revealed the consequential new evidence I have been discussing in these postings; and that the arguments upheld in that case have a significance that far transcends issues of Cold War espionage, let alone whether or not Alger Hiss was a spy. Upholding the importance of "fair comment" in a free society, the judge's charge and the jury ruling have been of immense service to academe, greatly reducing the menace of frivolous, ill-considered, or vexatious threats of legal action that put authors and their publishers at risk of lengthy and costly trials. Vassiliev v Frank Cass & Co Ltd. "has actually changed UK law, an Intelligence and National Security editor wrote me in October 2003. "It ensures that we are now immune from defamation if we have refereed an article." This was a

landmark decision in the battle to uphold freedom of expression and historical inquiry.

It is not my post but Dr. Haynes's in his that seeks to "have it both ways." On the one hand his posting states that Hiss's name on the Gorsky list proves he was a spy; on the other it argues that that list's omission from The Haunted Wood is of no consequence because it was "not relevant" (Haynes ignores its similar omission from the revised edition of Allen Weinstein's Perjury ). But the Gorsky memo is relevant precisely because it does NOT identify Hiss as 'Ales ', or even 'Lawyer', but assigns him an altogether novel cryptonym. Most crucially, contrary to Dr. Haynes's contention, the Gorsky memo does NOT say or imply that Hiss was the Soviet spy 'Leonard'; it merely identifies Hiss-as-Leonard as a one-time contact or source, which he certainly was. In the Washington of the 1940s, there was a world of difference between Soviet espionage and cooperation. I recall it vividly, having served in the State Department in 1946-1947, following a year and a half in Europe in the U.S. Army with the OSS on a mission felt vital, even that soon, to possible conflict with the Soviet Union.

General Kobayakov asks "What is the Gorsky list?" The very title of this December 1948 memorandum, --"Provaly" [Russian transcription can be supplied but not in this format] -- "Collapses" or "Failures in USA" (1938-48)"--is consonant with the General's surmise that it perhaps emanated from jail or a loony bin. Some of its provenance emerged in pre-trial and trial evidence in Vassiliev's unsuccessful suit for libel. It lends further damning substance to John Lowenthal's critique of The Haunted Wood. (As before, I abbreviate High Court Documents as CtD, Court Transcripts at CtT. Jury Bundles as Ct JB.)

According to Vassiliev, Gorsky's is "a list of names and code-names of American agents and sources ... prepared by Soviet operatives" and "composed in connection with [Elizabeth] Bentley's defection", although that had taken place three years previously (Vassiliev to Susan Butler, 9 June 2000, Ct JB 3:297A; Vassiliev response CtD 1.4, 20 July 2001; amended defence, CtD 1.3, 11 Feb 2002). He identified 'Collapses' as pp. 49-55 of "operational correspondence file 43173 vol.2(v), which contains letters, cables, memos, etc. written in the 1940s." Vassiliev testified that it was "at an early stage of my research I found" the Gorsky list, which would make it 1994 or 1995. His 3-page handwritten transcription was sent to the Court on 1 Feb 2002 (Vassiliev to Hartwig, CtD 1(c) and attachment). The first page also includes Vassiliev extracts from pages 46, 47, and 48 of that file. These unsigned and undated memoranda are unrelated to the "Provaly" list, but crucial for an understanding of its later dissemination, as shown below.

About half of the KGB materials Vassiliev abstracted underwent inspection by a Declassification Commission of the Foreign Intelligence Service (SVR) of the Russian Federation, including about 50 pages photocopied for him. The rest Vassiliev did not submit for review and release, but smuggled out without inspection. The Gorsky memo was in the latter category. Vassiliev explained that "it was impossible for him to photocopy documents, mentioning Alger Hiss by his real name, since the Russian Intelligence Services do not admit he co-operated with the Soviet Special Services." The Gorsky memo was included in the KGB material that Vassiliev brought from Moscow to London in 1996 (CtD paras 3 and 10, 27 Mar 2002 and 16 Apr 2002).

Just how--and hence how accurately-- the Gorsky document was transcribed is uncertain. Vassiliev testified that he "made summaries or verbatim transcriptions from the [KGB] files in his note-books which he kept at

home" in Moscow (CtD 16 Apr 2002, paras 1 and 2). Asked whether his summaries and transcriptions were made at the press bureau or at home, Vassiliev did not respond. The question is critical. If done at the press bureau, it would have been difficult, not to say dangerous, to remove his notes from the bureau premises without submitting them for declassification. If done at home from rough notes or memory, his transcriptions must have been subject to considerable error (Monson, CtD 19 Apr 2002, para (C)).

Moreover, the Gorsky memo along with the other NON-photocopied notes Vassiliev brought to London were not those in his original note-books; they were subsequent transcriptions. "My notebook file is in Russia because I didn't think I could smuggle them through the customs. So I put all my stuff on floppy discs. What I smuggled was floppy discs" (Susan Butler interview, Ct JB 3:411). The Gorsky list made available by Vassiliev to his co-author and later to the High Court had, then, been retranscribed from Vassiliev's disc.

In London Vassiliev drafted chapters of what became The Haunted Wood, first in Russian, then translated into English for Weinstein. Weinstein confirms this: "Using Vassiliev's initial draft and translations while incorporating new Western documentation, I wrote the English language translation" (The Haunted Wood, Introduction, p. xvi). Afterward Vassiliev "reviewed and amended several versions of the text, prepared by Allen Weinstein and [Random House editor] Robert D. Loomis" (Vassiliev amended reply, CtD 1(v), 17 July 2002).

In preparing matter for Weinstein, Vassiliev included as much raw material as he could. "I put every document in ... to let Allen make up his own mind ... To preserve his scientific correctness I wanted him to read as much of the documents as possible, so I composed my draft manuscript and put in there as much of the documents as possible" (Susan Butler interview, JB 3:418). This included the Gorsky memo, as Vassiliev told Susan Butler when declining her request for a translated copy of it: "I don't do it at the moment for two reasons: 1. It would be rather strange to spread the documents all over the world while I am trying to sue Weinstein and Random House for using them without my permission. 2. We are talking about old documents but they are still top secret because they haven't been formally declassified... The fact that I published them once (and Weinstein twice) doesn't necessarily mean I should spread them" (Butler/Vassiliev letters, 17 June 2000, Ct JB 3: 297A, 298).

Here Vassiliev errs. In fact Weinstein had NOT once, let alone twice, published or even referred to the Gorsky memo. File 43173, from which it comes, is cited in footnotes to many quotations throughout Haunted Wood. Volume 2v, the Gorsky memo's specific locus, appears in footnotes 27, 28, 32, 33, 41, 43, 49, 50, and 51 of Chapter 13; these refer to file pages both before and after the Gorsky memo's pp. 49-55. Vassiliev's notes suggest that he worked his way through each file from start to finish. It is reasonable to assume that his notebook, any floppy disc onto which it was entered, and any subsequent redaction, would enter notes from File 43172 Vol. 2v more or less seriatim.

And so indeed they do, showing that Weinstein must have seen the Gorsky memo. Especially telling are footnotes 50 and 51, to File 43173, Vol. 2v, pp. 46-47, referring to the text quotation (The Haunted Wood, pp. 296-97) from a somewhat later Gorsky memo that reads, in part: "[The Washington Station] practically stopped work on finding recruiters and new agents since the middle of 1949, either drawing to our work people largely known by their connections with the U.S. Communist Party ... or trying to use as agents officials from 'People's Democracy' [Eastern European]

countries sympathizing with us but not having information interesting to us." Weinstein and Vassiliev comment that "Gorsky criticized the appointment of nonprofessionals such as [Alexander] Panyushkin ['Vladimir'] to the post of station chief-as someone 'kept busy on his main job [and, therefore, who] cannot go deeply into all operational matters,'" but Gorsky blamed deputy section chief Gyorgi Sokolov ('Fyodor') for the recruiting failure. These sentences in The Haunted Wood are precisely the same sentences (translation slightly differs) that immediately precede the Gorsky memo ON VASSILIEV'S SAME MANUSCRIPT PAGE (Ct JB 3:306). Weinstein and Random House could not have failed to see the Gorsky memo and to recognize its salience.

Vassiliev testified that "the information contained in the document 'Collapses in the US' appeared in many other documents quoted in the book" (Amended reply, CtD para 8(iii), p. 14, 17 July 2002). But no such information is to be found in The Haunted Wood. As defence attorney Monson put it to the trial jury, "If Mr Weinstein and Vassiliev ... had been genuinely committed to giving the public a more accurate account of Soviet espionage than had ever been published before [claim in The Haunted Wood, p. xix], they would have published 'Collapses in the US' and discussed its implications" (Monson, CtT, 12 June 2003). That they did not do so, as noted in my previous posting, was a decision that Weinstein's co-author Vassiliev claims mystified and vexed him. Was that decision taken because Weinstein felt, rightly or wrongly, that including or even mentioning the Gorsky memo would have undercut his accusations against Hiss? As designated appointee to the highest archival post in the United States, Weinstein might enlighten us on this matter.

David Lowenthal



Copyright © 1995-2005 - Contact Us  
RSS | Validate: XHTML | CSS